

Chapter Two

THE DIVISION -- PLAN AND EXECUTION

An early and tangible outcome of the visitation must now receive attention. It would appear that if Fr. de Boynes had not come explicitly to arrange a division of the Maryland-New York Province, this topic soon became a major concern. By October 23, 1920, ten months after his arrival, he was able in a letter to sound out confidentially the views on some possible divisions which had been brought to his attention up to that time. This letter, along with its accompanying financial and man-power matters, listed four ways of dividing the Province. Since there were variations on two of the four possibilities, there really were six plans. The accompanying data analyzed how much revenue one or more possible provinces might expect. These figures employed the actual revenue received annually by the united Province from 1916-1918. The data also showed man-power available for current needs. It should be noted that, for some inexplicable reason, the total number of men was regularly listed as 1,100, although the Catalogue figures for 1919-1920, the year of de Boynes' arrival, listed total membership at 1080, and for 1920-1921, the year in which the letter of inquiry was written, at 1087.

According to Plan One, a north and a south province would be set up from the united Province. The north would comprise the territory of New England, New York State and New Jersey with a total of 876 men out of a total of 1,100. The south province would consist of the States of Pennsylvania, Delaware, Maryland, the District of Columbia, Virginia and West Virginia with a total of only 224 men. The north area would have eighteen houses, employing 161 men plus houses of formation at Poughkeepsie and Yonkers, New York. There may have been a lingering idea that Yonkers, called Woodstock-on-Hudson, could still be exploited as a scholasticate. The lower half of the old province would have eleven houses employing 161 men, plus the Maximum Collegium of Woodstock. A proposal for a province with as few as 224 men in comparison to one of 876 men could hardly gather much support. Hence, a modification was proposed. This modification might be considered a surprise. To close the gap in numbers between 876 and 224, the city of Buffalo and presumably Western New York was to be added to the south province. Thus, this enlarged south province would have 396 men while the north would be reduced from 876 to 704. This final south province total of 396 men is about what New England was then estimated as having, e.g., 398.

The second proposed division had no variation. The north half would consist of the New England States plus New York State north of, but not including, Yonkers. It would have 570 men and include St. Andrew's at Poughkeepsie. This division was really a different way

of adding Buffalo along with western, central and northern New York not to the south as in Plan One, but to New England. The second province in this plan would be New York State from Yonkers down, and all the remainder of the old Maryland-New York Province with 530 men. In this plan, man-power was quite equalized, 570 to the north, 530 to the south. The north would have a scholasticate at Poughkeepsie; the lower half would have two: Yonkers and Woodstock.

A third proposal was a three-way division. This was a foreshadowing of the gradual division of the old province into its three present constituent provinces. New England itself would have 398 men. The New York Province, including all New York State and all of New Jersey (not just two of its ecclesiastical divisions as today) would have 478 men. The southern-most part from Pennsylvania through West Virginia would have 224 men. No mention is made of North Carolina as a potential part of this third province. Since 224 is small in comparison to 398 and 478 in man-power, it was hinted (since the visitation of the undivided Missouri Province had not yet been made) that the colleges and residences of Cincinnati, Cleveland and Toledo might be conjoined with this south province.

The fourth plan which separated New England from the rest of the Maryland-New York province was the one finally put into effect. It noted that by origin there were 398 Jesuits to work in six New England institutions. The Immaculate Conception church, though joined with Boston College High School, was regularly considered a separate entity in Fr. de Boynes' figures. The six institutions employed 132 Jesuits. These figures contrasted with a personnel for the larger province of 702 men and with 23 institutions employing 396 men. All scholasticates would be outside of New England. On an average for the years 1916-1918, the New England area houses contributed in tax and surplus \$49,500 to the province. The larger half at the same time contributed \$185,000. Of this sum, however, \$80,000 annually came from The Messenger of the Sacred Heart, and \$31,000 from the province farms in Pennsylvania and Maryland. Thus \$75,000 annually came in taxes and surplus from the Maryland and New York houses. There were some other sources of income to the province. The Mission Band averaged \$30,000 a year chiefly from activities in New England and New York State. The Woodstock Aid was contributing \$60,000 a year. It was estimated that the united province had an annual income of \$298,500. No estimates were made in these figures of moneys derivable from wills or other bequests.

What specific advice to most of these inquiries on divisions Fr. de Boynes received is not known. Neither the New York Archives nor the Maryland Archives have any copies of such letters. One letter in the New England Archives is a reply dated December 22, 1919 from Fr. J. Havens Richards, S.J., then Superior of Keyser Island. From 1888-1898 he had been Rector at Georgetown and from September 2, 1915 to March 25, 1919 at 84th Street. He favored Plan Two. He cited the ease of railroad connections between Boston and Buffalo and

indicated the possibility of expansion into such cities of New York as Albany, Troy, Schenectady, Rochester, as well as into unspecified cities of New England. There is no mention of Syracuse where the greatest expansion in this area has taken place with Le Moyne College and Christ the King Retreat House.

Curiously, neither Fr. Richard's response nor Fr. de Boynes' letter make any reference to the Shrine of the North American Martyrs at Auriesville, New York. This shrine dates back to 1884. Perhaps the fact that it was not a year-round residence, but open only in the warmer-weather months may have led to it being unmentioned in any of the plans. It is difficult to believe that Fr. John J. Wynne, S.J., so intimately connected with the shrine and the cause of the martyrs, would favor its separation from New York under the alternate form of Plan One or of its union with New England as called for in Plan Two. Any reply which Fr. Wynne made on this subject would be a very interesting comment. From a conversation with him in 1929, it appeared evident that he favored the Fourth Plan which became the operative one.

A second letter on this subject now in the New England province Archives was found in the effects of Fr. Anthony C. Cotter, S.J. A hand-written notation attributes it to Fr. Paul R. Conniff, S.J., Rector of Gonzaga in Washington, when it was written. He opposed any division, the four suggested ones or any other possible ones. If a provincial was over-worked, as was the assumption made about the task at that time for the Maryland-New York provincial, he should delegate more authority to local Superiors. Moreover, he should be chosen as much for his proven administrative ability as for his piety. If, however, a division was to be effected, Fr. Conniff believed it would be bad to segregate New England as in Plan Three and Plan Four. As a basically Boston province, its members would be more provincial than they already were when connected with New Yorkers, Philadelphians, Washingtonians, Baltimorians and Buffalonians.

The present writer has listened to many eulogies of Fr. Paul Conniff from his early historical mentor, Fr. J.F.X. Murphy, S.J. He considered Fr. Paul the great man of honor and justice, worthy of early or immediate heavenly bliss in contrast to others of his contemporaries consigned by Fr. Murphy to lower regions or extended purgatories. Strangely (or not) it was Fr. David W. Hearn, in whose honor the chapel at Weston was given by Mrs. Helen Grant through Fr. James M. Kilroy, that Fr. Murphy felt to be the antithesis to his hero, Fr. Conniff. Fr. Hearn's fall in esteem probably came when as a native of Framingham, Massachusetts and a student at Boston College he was assigned in 1880 not to the Maryland Novitiate at Frederick, Maryland, but to the former New York Mission's Novitiate at West Park in New York. After the 1879 union this place served as a second Novitiate for the joint province until 1885. It was also on what Fr. J.F.X. considered Jansenistic attitudes, attributable to what he believed was a New York-Canadian Mission ethos, that Fr. Murphy let

fall his righteous wrath. His epitome of this spirit might be Fr. Thomas J. Campbell (always pronounced as Camel by older Jesuits) of whose possible stance on Keyser Island ownership this author later finds a good word to say.

Whatever information on division Fr. de Boynes received was forwarded to Rome. On April 13, 1921, Fr. General sent to the provincial of the Maryland-New York Province his specific determination concerning a division and asked for comments. On May 13 he received from Fr. Rockwell and his Consultors, of whom two were New Englanders, approval of the plan proposed. Fr. de Boynes, also questioned, wrote his views favorable to this same plan on May 21. Hence, dated June 24, 1921, came the document which settled matters for Plan Four of the proposals made in October 1920 by Fr. de Boynes. While the New England area was to be set aside with a Vice-Provincial, for the time being the old Maryland-New York province was to remain one and integral. Hence, final authority remained with the Maryland-New York provincial and he was explicitly in full charge of mission activity (Jamaica and the Philippines).

The Vice-Provincial was to be headquartered in Boston. He was to have four Consultors and a Socius. Because there were no houses of formation in New England, work should begin at once on acquiring necessary property for a novitiate, including a juniorate and a scholasticate, which might be a house of philosophy or of theology. Place of birth was to determine membership. Hence, shuttling men from one province to another according to this norm was gradually to be effected. However, reasons could be set forth and, if founded on a solid basis, accepted as grounds for assignment according to other norms than place of birth. The usual system of mass suffrages was to continue as if nothing had happened. This change was to become effective with its promulgation on Sunday, July 31, 1921.

In addition to Fr. General's June 24, 1921 decree setting up the New England area as a special kind of Vice-Province or Regio, there was also the appointment, effective July 31, 1921, of a Vice-Provincial. The choice was Fr. Patrick F. O'Gorman, S.J., who, as has been seen, was the Socius to Fr. de Boynes during the official visit. On the completion of this task, he was rector of St. Joseph's in Philadelphia for a few months. Since the search for property for a scholasticate in the Boston area had begun before the promulgation of a division, the fact of an impending division was known at least in some quarters. Some in the know may also have told it confidentially to one prudent friend, etc. Whether Fr. O'Gorman's choice was also known is not clear.

This choice of a Vice-Provincial may well have been a well-kept secret. One would gather so from an amusing story, now not verifiable, that has been current since the time of its alleged happening. Fr. O'Gorman, the story goes, presented himself with a request for an overnight stay at 761 Harrison Avenue on Saturday, July 30.

The Father Minister, to whom the request was made, was Fr. Charles E. Lane, S.J., Minister there since 1916, and, after sixteen years there the Minister at Boston College from 1932 to his death in April 1939. Fr. Lane liked to have requests made in advance, not when one arrived with a bag. Properly approached, Fr. Lane could be most cordial and shower one with at least a gift of Wenz candy for the recipient's mother. Fr. O'Gorman, understandably, had not requested a room in advance. He was given it grudgingly for one night. He complied by leaving next day to be on hand at Chestnut Hill for his reading in (as we say) as Vice-Provincial. One need not over-credit a part of the saga that had his belongings waiting for him at the guest room door on his return the next morning from breakfast. When Fr. O'Gorman's appointment was announced that evening from the pulpit at Boston College High School, one might wonder whether Fr. Lane's naturally florid countenance was even more red.

It is interesting to note that while the decree called for a Socius to the Vice-Provincial, there was no Fr. Socius until Fr. Louis J. Gallagher, S.J. was appointed in the fall of 1926 after the definitive division. In his first year as Vice-Provincial Fr. O'Gorman wrote much of his own correspondence as is evident from hand-written letters concerning potential purchases of property. In part, he could make use of secretarial help at Boston College. This is not always a satisfactory substitute. On September 27, 1922, Br. James L. Kilmartin, S.J. was brought from Woodstock College to Boston as coadjutor secretary, the first of the two Brothers who had extended and extraordinary tenures. Br. Kilmartin, who was never lost for a metaphor based on baseball, continued as the Br. Socius from these days with Fr. O'Gorman through the years of Fathers Kilroy, McCormick, Dolan and Father (now Archbishop) McEleney, and into Fr. Dolan's 1950 inter-regnum. He died August 16, 1950.

If a Fr. Socius was not appointed until September 26, 1926, Consultants were appointed early. In 1921-22 they were three in number: Fr. William A. Devlin, President of Boston College; Fr. John J. Geohan, S.J., Rector of Boston College High School and the Immaculate, and James J. Carlin, Rector of Holy Cross. Only when J. Harding Fisher had arrived at Shadowbrook in 1923 was there a fourth Consultant appointed on October 22, 1923. Not only was there no Socius, there was also no Vice-Province Treasurer. Money matters were the affair of the Province office in New York.

There was during the Vice-Provincial stage, another and more important Curial change. On November 6, 1924 Fr. O'Gorman was succeeded as Vice-Provincial by Fr. James M. Kilroy, S.J., then Rector at 84th Street in New York City. The two inter-changed places. This change brought a Boston man in charge of the Vice-Province as he was to be until appointed Provincial of the independent province on December 21, 1926. His promotion from Vice-Provincial to provincial was not automatic. A special terna was required at a Consultor's

meeting on May 11, 1926. Fr. Kilroy's name was placed first on the listing, in second place was Fr. James J. Carlin, and in third place Fr. John B. Creedon. Fr. General had required that only those men's names might be submitted who had exercised or were exercising religious jurisdiction over Jesuits. The Roman decree appointing Fr. Kilroy was not signed until November 26, 1926. In that capacity he continued to November 22, 1932 when he became Rector of Weston. In his regent days Fr. Kilroy, who had entered Frederick in 1896 along with James T. McCormick, J. Harding Fisher, W. Coleman Nevils, James A. Cahill and Michael J. Ahern, each of whom helped to form early New England personnel, taught at Xavier in New York. His first year of theology was made at Louvain, the remainder, at Woodstock. After his theology he was Prefect of Discipline for the year 1912-1913 at Georgetown (College and Prep combined) with Fr. John B. Creedon as Prefect of Studies. Among the New England regents there at the time were James H. Dolan, John Doherty and Leo A. Dore. In this year Fr. Kilroy was associated, therefore, with some of those who were later to be appointed by him as rectors and deans.

In 1914, Regis High School opened on 83rd Street in New York, endowed by the Hugh Grant family. In that very year, Mrs. Grant, who died on May 6, 1944, was declared a benefactress of the Society by Fr. Edward Fine, Vicar General at the time, and she was entitled to three Masses on her decease by the entire Society. Fr. Kilroy became the first principal of Regis. In March, 1919 he succeeded Fr. J. Havens Richards as Rector of the 84th Street establishment consisting of Regis, Loyola School, St. Ignatius Parish and a day-care center. During these New York years Fr. Kilroy enjoyed the respect and abiding loyalty of the Grant family, whose generosity was of capital importance in the financial affairs of the New England Jesuit family. As Pastor of St. Ignatius Church on Park Avenue Fr. Kilroy became familiar with the older Holy Week services which he could celebrate with precision and promptitude. Residents at Boston College in the forties and early fifties dreaded an old-style Holy Saturday service without Fr. Kilroy as principal. The size of St. Ignatius church in New York encouraged Fr. Kilroy to make notably ample blessings at the end of Mass, and these he continued in the somewhat ample size of Weston College chapel and even in smaller edifices. The present writer owes much in this matter to Fr. Kilroy's gestures of untinguardly amplitude.

Once New England had been established as a regio, there remained the task of acquiring and transforming property into use for houses of study, interchanging personnel on the basis of place of birth unless special reasons counselled otherwise, permitting the expansion of present institutions and activities, and arranging the financial settlement between the two parts of the former undivided province. In these pioneer days of the Vice-Province there was no expansion into new places or new activities. Studies that could be done in Rome were the chief form of higher academic pursuit. The future of expansion foreseen in Fr. J. Havens Richard's letter was to be left to be

initiated in the days of Fr. James H. Dolan. When the Maryland-New York Province was divided, Fr. Dolan had just finished theology. After immediate tertianship at St. Andrew's he taught junior and senior philosophy for three years at Holy Cross, was Rector six and one-half years at Boston College and Socius for another five and a half years. During his years as Socius, he kept in a most careful hand an excellent account of province business. The history of the province would be richer if he had been a perpetual socius. As provincial from May 1937 to December 1944 he began the notable and necessary expansion tasks that others followed and which changing times have forced to be either discontinued or contracted.



Woodstock-On-Hudson, New York

Yonkers, New York

